

Submission 078-04 – Grouping of International Umpires**COUNCIL MINUTE – NOVEMBER 2004****Decision**

Council approved the recommendation of the Constitution Committee that Submission 078-04 be deferred and a working party with members from the Constitution Committee and Race Officials Committee, prepare an enabling regulation to allow the classification/grouping of all ISAF Race Officials, and make a recommendation to the 2005 Mid-Year Meeting.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS – NOVEMBER 2004**Reporting Committee:**

The Race Officials Committee recommends that Council reject submission 078-04, **and also submissions 079-04, 080-04 and 081-04** for the following reasons:

The Race Officials Committee recommends that Council support the principle of a grouping system and believe that this does not require a specific regulation.

Principle Reasons

ISAF is required by the regulations to appoint Race Officials to specified events. In 2004 this amounted to well in excess of 400 appointments. ISAF needs a system to enable it to fulfil this requirement and this system must contain some form of selection based on experience and ability. The Grouping of IUs is a part of this system.

The Objectives of ISAF contained within the Constitution requires ISAF to ‘(a) to act and carry out the functions and duties of such authority.’ No further authorisation is required as the duty to appoint Race Officials is already specified in the regulation. ISAF could not operate if it required a regulation for every aspect of its work. (For example, the objects of ISAF and the terms of reference of the IUSC require ISAF to organise and run training seminars. There is no regulation to detail exactly how this responsibility is discharged.)

ISAF has a fundamental responsibility to best serve events, classes and sailors. While all Race Officials in each category (IJ, IU, IRO, IM) have the same certification, not all have the same experience or ability. When appointing Race Officials to events, ISAF must ensure that the team is appropriate to each event. ISAF must consider each event individually and all events to which it makes appointments as a whole. Each event requires:

- Race Officials with the appropriate experience and abilities to provide the services needed.
- Avoidance of conflicts of interest.
- Costs to be controlled.

Each event also provides an opportunity to develop Race Officials for the future.

No umpires are downgraded by this system. Umpires from all Groups (and those not grouped) are regularly appointed to Grade 1 events. However, the system does ensure that around 40% of the umpires for a Grade 1 event are from Group 1.

Based on the experience of the first year of operation a number of improvements have been incorporated for 2004/5. These improvements address the majority of the concerns expressed both in the submissions and at the 2004 IU Conference attended by 60% of IUs.

- The assessing panel has been increased from 5 to 10.
- The panel members do not know who each other are (to avoid any perception of being a self serving group).
- More information will be available to individual IUs who request more information or wish to question their group assignment.
- Umpires elect to be ‘grouped’ or not. As a consequence, Group 3 has been dropped and some umpires will remain ungrouped. Of the total population of 100 IUs, 28 have not applied to be Grouped.

Executive Committee:

The Executive Committee does not support submission 078-04 from the Russian Yachting Federation, the Deutscher Segler-Verband and the Royal Spanish Sailing Federation about no official grouping of IUs.

Match Racing Committee

The Match Racing Committee recommends that Council reject this submission.

ORIGINAL SUBMISSION**From the Russian Yachting Federation, the Deutscher Segler-Verband and the Royal Spanish Sailing Federation****Proposal:**

That there shall be no official Groups of IUs / no grouping of the IUs at all.

Current Position:

Five unknown people using unknown criteria assign each IU to one of three Groups in order to appoint umpires to Grade 1 events.

Reason:

Reasons from the Russian Yachting Federation:

1. Under the present Regulations Appointment Working Party has no rights to assign umpires to groups thus varying their international status approved by the Council
2. Such Working Party when asked by Executive Committee has all the rights to recommend or appoint Umpires for the top level MR Events in accordance with pp. 18.12; 18.12 (1-4) of the ISAF Regulations.

Reasons from the Deutscher Segler-Verband and the Royal Spanish Sailing Federation

It is the task of ISAF to keep all IUs on the required level to act in all grade 1 events by offering appropriate means to the IUs (for example: ISAF seminars, clinics, trainings etc.). If the new professional standard of the top grade 1 events now needs higher qualified IUs than in previous times, ISAF has to offer the necessary training so that the IUs can catch up with this higher standard. ISAF can then choose for the top grade 1 events those IUs who successfully took part in these seminars etc. By doing so any grouping is neither necessary nor desirable because it damages the necessary trustful relationship between the different groups of IUs.

If an IU is not generally fit for all grade 1 events, then the practiced system under regulation 34.5 is wrong and should be meliorated.